

## Elevated Standards of Proof and Pleading: Daubert

### James Langenfeld

The Future of Private Antitrust Enforcement

AAI, Washington D.C.

Dec 10, 1007

## **Admissibility Rates for Daubert Challenges**

Criminologists/Forensics .847

TIM

- Appraisers .800
- Chemists .722
- Hydrologists .667
- Statisticians .647
- Metallurgists .600

#### Accountants/Economists .598

- Admiralty Experts .556
  - Aviation Experts .500
    - Fire Experts .478
      - Physicians .463
      - Engineers .390
- Accident Reconstructionists .387
  - Psychologists/Psychiatrists .371
    - Attorneys .333
    - Marketing Experts .333
      - Nurses .333
      - Toxicologists .308

Source: http://www.daubertontheweb.com/leader\_board.htm

Polygraphers .121

Lecg

## **Admissibility of Accountants/Economists in Antitrust Cases**

11

#### **Case (Final Decisions)**

# <u>Admissibility</u>

Concord Boat Corp. v. Brunswick Corp. (2000)

Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. v. Visa U.S.A., Inc. (2002)

Lantec, Inc. v. Novell, Inc. (2002)

Berlyn, Inc. v. Gazette Newspapers, Inc. (2003)

Williamson Oil Co. v. Philip Morris USA (2003)

Conwood Co., L.P. v. U.S. Tobacco Co. (2003)

Craftsmen Limousine, Inc. v. Ford Motor Co. (2004)

LePage's, Inc. v. 3M (2004)

El Aguila Food Prods., Inc. v. Gruma Corp. (2005)

Champagne Metals v. Ken-Mac Metals, Inc. (2006)

Admissibility reversed

**Appeal Granted, class certification affirmed** 

**Exclusion affirmed** 

**Exclusion affirmed** 

**Exclusion affirmed** 

Admissibility affirmed

Admissibility reversed

**Admissibility affirmed** 

**Exclusions affirmed** 

**Exclusion affirmed** 

Admissibility Rate 30%

**Challenges to Plaintiff's Accountant/Economist: 100%**